Responsible tourism development-A systematic review & bibliometric analysis

P. G. S. S. Pattiyagedara1*, J. P. R. C. Ranasinghe2
Uva Wellassa University of Sri Lanka1&2
shashika.p@uwu.ac.lk, ruwan@uw.ac.lk2

Abstract
Purpose: This study aims to systematically review and conduct a bibliometric analysis of the literature on Responsible Tourism development using articles published between 2002 and 2023.

Research Methodology: Systematic literature review (SLR) was conducted using established databases using preferred reporting items for systematic review meta-analysis (PRISMA) guidelines, and Vosviewer software was employed to identify key trends, themes, and contributors in the field.

Results: The review identified a growing body of literature on Responsible Tourism and found key phrases in scientific publications, predominantly on Responsible Tourism development: 71 articles were included from Lens.ORG, Emerald Insight, and Google Scholar databases, all of which were formatted for Lens. ORG. The two main themes were (1) economic development-related outcomes and (2) sustainability of tourism-based outcomes. The findings imply that future study trends should focus on sustainable outcomes such as responsible tourism development. A bibliometric analysis revealed a network of authors and their notable contributions from both academia and industry.

Limitations: The study was limited by the availability of literature in the searched databases and the scope of the review over a considerable period.

Contributions: Understanding responsible tourism development by providing a comprehensive overview of the literature and illustrating key trends and themes is the major contribution of this study. It also highlights the need for further research in certain areas regarding the role of technology in responsible tourism development and enhancing residents’ quality of life.

Keywords: Tourism, Sustainable Tourism, Responsible Tourism, Economic Growth, Quality of Life


1. Introduction
Tourism is recognized as the largest and fastest-expanding industry in the world because of its dynamic nature. Owing to the unbridled demand from growing markets, travel and tourism have a promising future. According to Matthew (2017), many tourists are concerned with ethical practices that involve a tourist's location with responsible products. The idea of inclusive development considers social and cultural advancement, environmental preservation, and sustainable tourism. One of these ideas is responsible for tourism, which is still in development. Scholars in the tourism field have given the idea of responsible tourism an abundance of attention. "Making locations that are better for people to visit as well as live in. Basically, showcases as responsible tourism". Hoteliers, operators, governments, tourists, and locals must assume responsibility and take action to make tourism more sustainable. The Cape Town Declaration of 2002 acknowledges that responsible tourism can take many forms. It is defined as travel and tourism that minimizes adverse economic, environmental, and social impacts;
increases economic benefits for locals; improves the well-being of host communities; improves working conditions and access to the industry; involves locals in decisions that have an impact on their lives and life changes; and makes positive contributions to the local environment. According to the definition of responsible tourism, it involves providing visitors with better vacation experiences, giving tourist businesses greater commercial prospects, and assisting local populations to enjoy a better quality of existence through higher socioeconomic advantages and improved natural resource management. The community’s residents are affected by tourism, and local community involvement is crucial for the sustainable management of the destination. Consequently, how tourism affects a community’s Quality of Life (QOL) is an indicator of the competitiveness and prestige of a location. The concept of sustainable tourism is one of the fastest growing areas of concern in the tourism industry and there are two of the main tenets of the concept are tourism organizations should be committed to minimizing their negative impacts on the environment and culture of a region, and tourism organizations should ensure that residents benefit from any increased income and employment derived through tourism (Bojanic, 2011).

Ecotourism and other specialized tourism are seen as specialized travel and tourism products in Sri Lanka, where they are perceived as a more environmentally friendly option. Due to the tsunami, the war in the north, and the terrorism that has dealt a cruel blow to peace, there are several difficulties concerning responsible tourism in Sri Lanka. Be mindful of community needs, and the most crucial thing is to help the locals financially (Duminduhewa, Wimalarathana, & Kaldeen, 2020). According to public policymakers and community planners, tourism is one of the major contributors to the host community, giving money, foreign exchange, local employment, tax revenue, and a multiplier effect. There is a trend of increasing recognition of the significant shift away from the predominance of traditional tourism concepts such as sun, sand, and sea holidays towards more experiential vacations. According to Goodwin and Francis (2003), responsible tourism represents a substantial market trend toward ethical consumerism and lifestyle marketing. Sustainable life change is a goal of tourism that also benefits the local economy, society, and environment. According to Matthew (2017), providing authentic experiences to tourists, improving the Quality of Life (QOL) of destination communities, and active stakeholder participation are the goals of this strategy. Whilst there is a great deal of research emerging in the field of responsible tourism, a majority is focused on the corporate social responsibility of hotels (Tay, Chan, Vogt, & Mohamed, 2016).

The contribution of business firms to sustainable destination management must be ensured. The majority of studies have been conducted regarding the perspectives of tourists and service providers. Previous studies capture the different benefits associated with responsible tourism initiatives. Frey and George (2010) explained perceptions regarding responsible tourism from tourism business owners’ perspectives. The results revealed positive attitudes towards responsible tourism initiatives. However, different studies have concluded the role of responsible tourism initiatives and their impact on different layers. Hence, according to Mathew and Sreejesh (2017), no study has examined how responsible tourism influences the sustainable perception of the local community and quality of life.

According to Sariskumar and Bhavan (2018), there is little empirical evidence to support the impact of responsible tourism on destination sustainability. Hence, understanding where the real benefits of responsible tourism will create favorable destination sustainability or enhance the quality of life is most important (Hanafiah et al., 2016). Review studies attempt to synthesize the existing literature and address the gaps prevailing to direct future research agendas (Andrlić et al., Priyashantha, & De Alwis, 2023; Priyashantha, 2023; Priyashantha, De Alwis, & Welmillla, 2022; Priyashantha & Dilhani, 2022). Reviewing research studies on these subject areas is essential because it enables policy formulation, informed decision-making, and the identification of research gaps that should be addressed to better understand responsible tourism development in the current scenery. This study was conducted in the period between 2002-2023.

The primary objective of this study was to identify existing knowledge of the Responsible Tourism Development period of 2002-2023. To answer the research question and objective, the researcher...
adopted a Systematic Literature Review using articles published between 2002 and 2023 that adhered to the PRISMA guidelines. Articles were retrieved from the lens. Org, Emerald Insight, and Google Scholar. To address this objective, keyword co-occurrence analysis was performed using VOSviewer. These reviews highlight the numerous contemporary themes covered in current academic literature. Each study offered information on the subject matter under consideration, but further analysis of this literature using rigorous bibliometric approaches may provide additional information that has not been properly understood or evaluated. In this sense, bibliometric methods can be a strong approach to identifying established and emergent current themes, as well as identifying research organizations and scholars, to highlight how diverse fields of thought may have emerged based on institutional and author characteristics. Identifying the most significant researchers within a group sets the door for identifying further emerging fields of study by identifying the newer topics explored by these researchers.

The following structure was utilized to present the paper's content: A detailed description of the study's "materials and methods" and its "results and findings" can be found in the following sections of the article. The Materials and Methods section describes the processes and methods used. The most significant findings made during the study are detailed in the "results and findings" section. The four subheadings that make up this section are "selection of articles," "characteristics of articles," "results of the articles," and "reporting the bias assessments." Then after that, the "discussion," "conclusion," and "practicality and research implications" are provided.

2. Literature Review
2.1 Tourism Industry
As an important economic activity in most regions, tourism has significant indirect effects on the economy. According to the Travel and Tourism Council (WTTC), the forecast for the direct contribution of travel and tourism to global GDP in 2029 is estimated at 5563 trillion U.S. dollars. By contrast, the total contribution to GDP worldwide is predicted to reach US$ 18, 031 billion by 2029. Tourism is a significant industry in both developed and developing countries which contributes to the national economic growth, and diversification of a country (Pathiraja, Karunaratne, Hewage, & Jayawardena, 2021). However, both developed and developing nations engage in some level of tourism activities either as revenue generators or as economic diversifiers to boost their economies (George 2021). According to the State Skill Development Project (SSDP), the tourism industry has developed several distinct types considering diversity, abundance of attractions, and activities such as heritage tourism, wildlife tourism, business tourism, medical tourism, eco-tourism, Buddhist circuits, religious tourism, and so on. Further, there are more innovations as a sector closely interconnected with other industries, such as transport, hospitality, accommodation, and entertainment. It has a considerable impact on the social, economic, and environmental aspects. Culture and Technology. Considering the dynamic nature, according to UNWTO (1980) "Activity essential to the life of nations because of its direct effects on the social, cultural, and educational and economic sectors of national societies and their international relations." This has provided an opportunity to grow the need for sustainability of tourism development as alternate concepts like Sustainable Tourism, Green Tourism, Eco-Tourism, Pro-Poor Tourism, Accessible Tourism, and Responsible Tourism.

2.2 Responsible Tourism
Sustainable tourism indicators (STIs) are an integral element of tourism planning and management (Rasoolimanesh, Ramakrishna, Hall, Esfandiar, & Seyfi, 2023). The demands of current visitors and host communities are met via sustainable and responsible tourism development, which safeguards and expands prospects for the future (Uchinlaiyen, Sarkar, & Saha, 2022). The monopolistic control of tourism development has caused negative attitudes towards tourism. This issue can be avoided by adopting a responsible tourism policy. The idea behind sustainable tourism is driven by visits to destinations without harming the natural environment or local communities (Ekpah 2021). According to Stanford (2006), tourism development frequently uses terms such as green tourism, sustainable tourism, alternative tourism, eco-tourism, and fair-trade tourism. Responsible tourism differs from other tourism concepts, such as eco-tourism, green tourism, and sustainable tourism. While eco-tourism and green tourism are based on the environmental domain, sustainable concepts are based on the triple
bottom line concept. Responsible Tourism focuses on local community development, ownership, and natural conservation. Responsible tourism has four main dimensions: economic, social, cultural, and environmental. Alternative tourism has emerged as a socially responsible and environmentally conscious form of tourism with respect to all parties concerned. According to Sariskumar and Bhavan (2018), alternative tourism is best replaced by “Responsible Tourism”.

Responsible Tourism minimizes the negative economic, Social, and Environmental impacts, generates greater economic benefits for the local community by enhancing the well-being of the host community and improving working conditions, makes a positive contribution to the conservation of natural cultural and heritage diversity, and offers more enjoyable opportunities and experiences for visitors by building a meaningful relationship with the local community by providing a greater understanding of the local culture and social and environmental value. Furthermore, it provides access to people with disabilities with cultural sensitivity, enhancing local pride and confidence. According to the AITO Responsible Tourism policy, protecting the environment, respecting local cultures, benefiting local communities, conserving natural resources, and minimizing pollution are identified as the responsible tourism guidelines (Goodwin & Francis, 2003).

2.3 Approaches in Tourism
In line with the themes of Sustainable Development, the term responsible development envisions the “Triple Bottom line” by assigning equal weight to the three pillars of sustainability Economics, Society, and Environment. The triple-bottom-line approach provides a holistic view of responsibility. It is a combination of the overall sustainability practices, their business function, social-cultural, economic, and environmental roles to contribute to the development of employees, stakeholders, local community, and society.

![Figure 1. Triple bottom line](source: Alhaddi, H (2015))
2.4 Responsible Tourism and Destination Sustainability

As a novel concept and recently initiated phase, there is little empirical evidence supporting the impact of responsible tourism on destination sustainability. The positive impacts of tourism have been widely discussed in case studies. Hanse, policymakers, and researchers have considered the meaningful impact of responsible and sustainable tourism. According to the Cape Town Declaration, responsible tourism is a three-tiered approach. Tourism development should improve the quality of destination communities, create better business opportunities, and improve tourist experiences (Frey & George, 2010). According to the responsible tourism guidelines of South Africa, responsibility is conceptualized as providing better holiday experiences for visitors, providing good business opportunities, enhancing the quality of life with social and economic benefits, and enhancing natural resource management. According to Frey and George (2010), the common objective of responsible tourism is minimizing the negative, economic, and social impact of the development of tourism. Some studies have mentioned responsible tourism as follows: Responsible tourism has played a significant role in the sustainability of destinations (Mathew & Kuriakose, 2018). Using public–private partnership strategies effectively minimizes social and environmental impacts and improves local economic benefits to the community. Further initiatives of “Pro-poor tourism” are aimed at bringing positive economic, social, and environmental impacts.

Further, Wight (2013), responsible tourism initiatives in Namibia, produced desirable outcomes such as sustainable design, management, and planning; minimized waste generation; effective resource management; productive mitigation strategies; enhanced community participation, cultural preservation, and community empowerment; and increased local economic benefits and stakeholder consultation. The Global Code of Ethics by the United Nations World Tourism Organization (UNWTO) stresses the necessity of the positive impacts of tourism on society, economy, and ecosystems. The Responsible Tourism Guidelines of Kerala specify that the form of responsible tourism seeks to minimize negative economic, environmental, and social impacts while providing greater social and economic benefits to the local community by enhancing the well-being of host community lifestyles. Based on the above context, it is hypothesized that responsible tourism is created by maintaining the sustainability of the destination.

2.5 Responsible Tourism and Quality of Life

The impact of tourism on residents’ QoL has been examined in previous studies (Sirgy et al. 2009). Previously, the Quality of life domain was commonly measured using economic measurements. However, the value of economic growth remains questionable. Recently, residents’ quality of life has been recognized as the perception of happiness and well-being within life domains, such as economic, social, environmental, consumer, and health domains (Uysal, Sirgy, Woo, & Kim, 2016). Tourism is a tool by which Millennium Development Goals (MDGs) can be achieved (UNWTO, 1980). Millennium Development Goals aim to improve the human well-being of the community by reducing poverty, hunger, and child and maternal mortality; ensuring education for all; controlling and managing diseases; ensuring sustainable development; and pursuing global partnerships by 2015. Tourism can enhance quality of life. There is a strong relationship between residents’ quality of life and the standards of recreation and service facilities. Further Aref (2011), there is a positive effect of tourism on the quality of life of the residents. Quality of life, community, emotional, and health and safety well-being. Hence, there is a relationship between responsible tourism and residents’ quality of life.

According to Mathew and Sreejesh (2017), the degree of well-being felt by an individual refers to their quality of life. Furthermore, responsible tourism practices, personal life, and health have affected the residents’ quality of life. Based on these arguments, propositions were developed as significant relationships between perceived economic, environmental, social, and cultural impacts and residents’ quality of life.
3. Research Methodology
3.1 Study Selection Process and Methods
The SLR approach was used in this investigation. To plan, conduct, and produce reports during an SLR, the PRISMA framework must be followed (Liberati et al., 2009). According to the PRISMA guidelines, the researcher created a protocol at the design stage of this study, and Table 1 contains its content. The inclusion criteria, search terms, analytic techniques, and reporting structure were all part of the article selection process. According to Table 1, PRISMA criteria were used to establish the article selection process, analytic processes, and reporting structure. The search terms and article inclusion criteria were determined at the planning level (Table 1). Inclusion criteria 5 (journal articles) and 6 (empirical articles) were selected for use in this study as there are justifications to include them for screening articles in SLRs.

Table 1. Review protocol

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Article selection method</th>
<th>PRISMA guidelines</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Search strings</td>
<td>Responsible Tourism, Responsible Tourism Development</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Inclusion criteria</td>
<td>1. Year range: 2002 -2023</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>2. Subject area: All Subject areas</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>3. Language of article: English</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>4. Key Words; Responsible Tourism, Responsible Tourism Development</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>5. Source type: Journals</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>6. Type of Study: Empirical and meta-analysis</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>7. Methodological quality: Articles that followed the Quantitative and Qualitative methodology (Mixed Methods)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Databases</td>
<td>Lens. Org, Emerald, Google Scholar</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Analysis Method</td>
<td>Keyword Co-occurrence Analysis, PRISMA guidelines</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Reporting structure</td>
<td>PRISMA guidelines</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Source: Authors’ conception (2023)
As shown in Table 1, the PRISMA specifications, for which the PRISMA flow diagram was created, were used to select articles. Three phases are involved: "identification," "screening," and "included." These procedures were followed in this study (Figure 1). The search terms used for "identification" were "Responsible Tourism" and "Responsible Tourism Development.” The researcher used both manual and machine screening techniques to screen for publications.

![PRISMA Flow Diagram](image)

Figure 2. PRISMA article selection for the flow diagram.
Source: Authors creation based on the PRISMA flow diagram (2023)

### 3.2 Study risk of the bias assessment

Both the inclusion of the article and its analysis may indicate a reviewer bias. It is crucial to use unbiased analytic techniques (Kitchenham & Charters, 2007), follow a systematic procedure for article inclusion, and conduct a concurrent, objective quality assessment of articles by various researchers (Brereton, Kitchenham, Budgen, Turner, & Khalil, 2007). By following the aforementioned criteria, the potential risk of bias associated with article inclusion and analysis was eliminated.

### 3.3 The analysis methods

To examine the content and structure of an article, the researcher employed mathematical tools built on the Biblioshiny and VOSviewer platforms (Aparicio, Iturralde, & Maseda, 2019; Van Eck & Waltman, 2014). As a result, the co-occurrence relationship of such terms in articles can be used to establish the links of such networks (Aparicio et al., 2019). According to Van Eck and Waltman (2014), VOSviewer presents them as "keyword co-occurrence network visualizations". The substance of the keyword co-occurrence network visualization can be understood after relativizing the relationships between the terms (Cobo, López-Herrera, Herrera-Viedma, & Herrera, 2012; Priyashantha et al., 2022). This process was carried out by normalizing the keyword co-occurrence network visualization (Andrić et al., 2023; Van Eck & Waltman, 2014). Consequently, VOSviewer constructs a network in a two-dimensional space by default and uses association strength normalization (Van Eck & Waltman, 2014; Priyashantha et al., 2022). After relativizing the relationships between terms, the content of the keyword
co-occurrence network visualization can be comprehended (Cobo et al., 2012; Priyashantha et al., 2022). This is accomplished by normalizing the keyword co-occurrence network visualization (Andrlić et al., 2023; Van Eck & Waltman, 2014). As a result, VOSviewer constructs a network in a two-dimensional space by default and performs association strength normalization (Priyashantha et al., 2022; Van Eck & Waltman, 2014). Reading each article's abstract and results section allowed the researchers to survey the findings for each clustered term.

Regions that are not frequently associated with responsible tourism were discovered using the density visualization map using the VOS viewer program. The quantity of nearby keywords was explained. Red indicates the area with the highest concentration of keywords, blue indicates keywords with a lower weight, and green indicates keywords with an average weight (Andrlić et al., 2023; Chen, Liu, Luo, Webber, & Chen, 2016; Van Eck & Waltman, 2014). The researcher might identify study gaps for subsequent studies by employing density visualization maps. Using the display of keyword co-occurrence density in Figure 10, the areas that require further investigation were determined. Additionally, the software was used to gather "overall information of the article set," "annual article publication," "average citation received," and "source journals of articles" to clarify the defined profile of the article in the review. The first four outputs were created using R-Biblioshiny and VOSviewer was used to generate the final output.

4. Results and discussions

Using the PRISMA flow diagram during its first stage (identification), the researcher discovered 208 articles were identified. Articles were found using records from Google Scholar, LENS.Org, and Emerald Insight. Articles generated between 2002 and 2023 were the first inclusion criteria (the term "responsible tourism" was introduced to the subject in the 2002 Cape Town Declaration). In total, 156 articles were excluded based on the year of publication. All subject areas for this study were taken into consideration by Criterion 2. The article's language should be English, under Criterion 3. Three items were excluded because they used a language other than English. All articles were selected using the keywords "Responsible Tourism and Responsible Tourism Development" by criterion 4, and three of the remaining articles were disqualified because they met criterion 5 and were concept papers. Twelve book chapters and seven articles from conference proceedings were also disregarded because they refused to meet Criterion 5 because they were not published in journals. The mentioned eighty-three (83) articles were excluded automatically, and according to the PRISMA Framework, due to the irrelevant nature of the content, 42 articles were excluded manually by the researcher.

Six articles were considered irrelevant because they did not satisfy Criterion 7, their methodologies were unclear, and their perspectives were not focused on. The remaining 77 articles were manually reviewed for all seven inclusion criteria. Fig. 1 illustrates the entire set of articles.

4.1 Main Information of article sets

Responsible Tourism Development (RTD) has emerged as a critical paradigm in the broader context of sustainable tourism. A Systematic Review & Bibliometric Analysis would involve examining the concept, theoretical underpinnings, and existing literature related to responsible tourism development. The integration of diverse theoretical perspectives positions the study within the diverse landscape of responsible tourism development, offering a comprehensive understanding through which to examine the current state of research in the field of social science. This section describes the characteristics of the study. The overall information on the articles is presented in Table 2. Consequently, 71 articles from 43 journals published between 2003 and 2023 were included in this review. A total of 151 authors were included. There were 782 references in total, along with 41 author keywords. The annual number of scientific publications from 2003 to 2023 is shown in Fig. 2. A typical number of citations of publications is shown in Fig. 3. It shows that 20 citations have been placed on performances published in 2020. Five citations were received for the papers published in 2021. The number of citations indicates a subject’s popularity. There have been no citations in this instance. Consequently, the researcher concluded that the topic's popularity was extremely low. The pertinent sources of articles are shown in Fig. 3. This provides connections to the top eight sources with the most frequently cited articles.
Accordingly, journals on sustainable tourism, global hospitality and tourist themes, and sustainable and responsible tourism have the highest number of publications (9, 9, 3).

Table 2. Main Information of article sets

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Description</th>
<th>Results</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Timespan</td>
<td>2002:2023</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Sources (Journals)</td>
<td>43</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Documents</td>
<td>71</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Annual Growth Rate %</td>
<td>7.18</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Document Average Age</td>
<td>5.3</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Average citations per doc</td>
<td>0</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>References</td>
<td>782</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Keywords Plus (ID)</td>
<td>41</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Author's Keywords (DE)</td>
<td>41</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Authors</td>
<td>151</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Single-authored docs</td>
<td>20</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Co-Authors per Doc</td>
<td>2.42</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

4.1.1 Annual Scientific Publication

Figure 3. Annual Scientific Publication
According to the results illustrated by Rstudio software (Biblioshiny), the researcher can conclude that there is growing attention to researching responsible tourism development from 2003 to 2023. In the initial stage, there was a slow upword with slopes, and after 2012, steady attention was paid to responsible tourism development.

Figure 4. Most Relevant Sources

According to the analytical results, the most relevant source of responsible tourism development is the Journal of Sustainable Development. The majority of researchers have published their research work here.

Figure 5. Annual Article Publication
4.1.2 Three-Field plot

The three-field plot visualizes the connectivity of all terms related to research publications. According to the output of Biblioshiny analysis, the size of each item in the diagram of three field plots explains the proportion or frequency of the keywords, the number of publications in the journals (Sources), and how many authors have done the publications. Here, the researcher used the middle of the three-field plot to explain the keywords related to the selected journals, the sources of which are illustrated on the right side of the plot, and the authors of the journals display the left side of the plot.

4.2 Results of the articles

The findings essential to the objectives of the study are explained in this section. Network, density, and keyword co-occurrence analyses were employed to generate the results. Specifically, the term co-occurrence network visualization addressed the first purpose, which was to identify the body of existing knowledge regarding the development of responsible tourism between 2002 and 2023. The research objective was further addressed by the term co-occurrence density visualization, which identified places that were uncommon in the 2002–2023 landscape of empirical research. The major findings of this study are explained below.

4.3 The current empirical knowledge in Responsible Tourism Development

Using the minimum keyword occurrence functionality of the VOSviewer software, the researcher observed that several threshold keywords were reported. Table 3 displays the threshold keyword numbers for the various occurrence levels. To identify the most prevalent areas of responsible tourism development, 15 occurrences were identified. The 15 keywords’ frequency and correlations with one another are shown in Table 3 and Figure 6. The strength of the link between keywords is indicated by the line thickness in Fig. 10 (Priyashantha et al., 2022; Van Eck & Waltman, 2014). The node size indicates how frequently something happens. A higher frequency indicated that the nodes were larger.

Table 3. Keywords with a minimum of one occurrence in the article

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Keyword</th>
<th>Occurrences</th>
<th>Total link strength</th>
</tr>
</thead>
</table>

Figure 6. Three-Field plot
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Sustainable development</th>
<th>2</th>
<th>13</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Global governance</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>7</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Social sustainability</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>7</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Local economic development</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>7</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Corporate governance</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>7</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Economic growth</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>7</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Local community</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>7</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Responsible tourism</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>6</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Responsible tourism</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>6</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Responsible behavior</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>6</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Figure 7: The keywords co-occurrence network visualization

The researcher used a co-citation network of 71 journal articles to demonstrate the network visualization. In the network visualization, items are represented by their labels, by default, and by a circle. The weight of an item determines the size of the label and the circle surrounding it. The higher the weight of the term in the considered research, the greater the label and circle. In contrast to this study's results, sustainable development has a stronger influence in this context. Some labels (social sustainability) are not shown here. This was performed to prevent overlapping of labels. The cluster to which an item belongs determines the item's separate color. The links are represented by lines between terms. The red color appears in the viewer output. Within this cluster are the terms Global Governance, Corporate Governance, Economic growth, local economic development, social sustainability, and the
local community. Moreover, Sustainable Development, Responsible behavior, responsible tourism, and stakeholders’ considerations belong to another cluster with a green color. The keywords that appeared most frequently in the literature were sustainable tourism, responsible tourism, responsible behavior, and stakeholders.

![Overlay Visualization of selected keywords](image)

**Figure 8. Overlay Visualization of selected keywords**

In overlay visualization, the research components are colored differently, where the colors range from blue (lowest score) to green (medium score) to yellow (highest score). In the bottom-right corner of the visualization, there is a color bar. It describes how the scores are assigned to colors. According to the Vosviewer output, blue color terms, such as global governance, corporate governance, economic growth, local economic development, and social sustainability, had a high score from 2014 to 2016. Furthermore, from 2016 to 2020, there was a strong emphasis on sustainable development, which is represented by the green color. From 2020 to the present, the new trend focuses on responsible tourism, responsible behavior, and stakeholder management after assessing the validity of sustainability advancements. Yellow emphasizes the aforementioned findings. Based on this, the researcher emphasizes that society is now adhering to sustenance-based expectations.
In item density visualization, items are represented by different color codes. The colors ranged from blue to green to yellow. The greater the number of objects in a point's neighborhood and the greater the weights of nearby items, the closer the color of the point is to yellow. The opposite is true: the smaller the number of objects in a point's neighborhood and the lower the weights of the nearby items, the closer the color of the point is to blue. Sustainable tourism had the highest total bond strength. For example, responsible tourism, responsible behavior, and stakeholders are especially related to their common field of research, while global governance, corporate governance, economic growth, social sustainability, local community, and local economic development are related to another common field of research.
When items have been assigned to the clusters, cluster density visualization occurs in the cluster density visualization, the color of a point in the visualization is obtained by mixing the colors of different clusters. Here, by using the Vosviewer output of the cluster density visualization researcher, two clusters (red and green) can be obtained.
Figure 11. Network Visualization of all usable keywords

Figure 12. Overlay Visualization of all usable keywords
The strength of the connection between keywords is indicated by the line thickness in Figs. 6 and 7 (Priyashantha et al., 2022; Van Eck & Waltman, 2014). The node size indicates how frequently something happens. A higher frequency indicated that the nodes were larger. The other relationships shown in Fig. 6 were examined using keyword clustering in various color schemes. Depending on the number of keyword occurrences, VOSviewer divides keywords into clusters. The keywords are connected and only come from one phenomenon when they are grouped in a specific cluster.
(Priyashantha, De Alwis, & Welmillia, 2023) Table 5 illustrates the two universal themes that appeared from the two clusters as a result. They are (1) economic development-related outcomes and (2) sustainability of tourism-based outcomes.

Table 4. Clusters with categorization of keywords

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Color Code</th>
<th>Cluster theme</th>
<th>Keywords</th>
<th>Authors</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Red</td>
<td>Economic Development related outcomes</td>
<td>Local Economic Development</td>
<td>(Smith &amp; Font, 2014; Stoffelen, Adiya, Vanneste, &amp; Kotze, 2020)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>Economic growth</td>
<td>(Koutra, 2008; Nair, Hussain, Lo, &amp; Ragavan, 2015; Smith &amp; Font, 2014)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>Corporate governance</td>
<td>(Bertella &amp; Romanelli, 2020; Stoffelen et al., 2020)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>Social Sustainability</td>
<td>(Smith &amp; Font, 2014; Stoffelen et al., 2020)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>Global governance</td>
<td>(Chan &amp; Tay, 2016; Smith &amp; Font, 2014; Stoffelen et al., 2020; Tay et al., 2016)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>(Zakaria, 2021)</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Journals:

- Journal of Sustainable Tourism
- Journal of Sustainable Tourism
- Journal of Sustainable Tourism
- Journal of Sustainable Tourism
- Journal of Sustainable Tourism
- Journal of Sustainable Tourism and Entrepreneurship
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Local Community</th>
<th>Sustainable Development</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Green</td>
<td>Sustenance of tourism-based outcomes</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

(Dale, L’Espoir Decosta, & Kelly, 2022; Djedi, Aït-Yahia, & Sofiane, 2022; Erawan & Krait, 2020; Gijsbers & Gonzalez Gutierrez de Leon, 2019; Legrand & Nielsen, 2018; Mathew, 2022; Mondal & Samaddar, 2022; Nguyen, Vo, To, & Dinh, 2022; Séraphin, Ivanov, Yallop, & Fotiadis, 2022; Simmons, Bushell, & Scott, 2010; Xiong, Huang, Leung, Zhang, & Cai, 2023)

(Heslinga, Hartman, & Wielenga, 2021)

(Eichelberger, Heigl, Peters, & Pikkemaat, 2021; Iriarte & Musikanski, 2019; Nair et al., 2015; Simmons et al., 2010)

Journal of Sustainable Tourism
International Journal of Culture, Tourism and Hospitality Research
Journal of Sustainable Tourism Management Perspectives Elsevier
Journal of Ecotourism

Journal of Environmental Management; Asia Pacific Business Review; Journal of Tourism Futures; Journal of Hospitality and Tourism Insights; Emerald Publishing Limited; Advances in Hospitality and Leisure
Economic development-related keywords, such as local economic development, economic growth, corporate governance, social sustainability, global governance, and local community, were discovered under the red cluster. The green cluster serves to maintain the sustenance of tourism-based outcomes such as responsible tourism, sustainable development, responsible behavior, and stakeholder perspectives.

Economic development: According to Arie (2018), with the expansion of responsible tourism, many developing nations are interested in finding a balance between macroeconomic, growth-oriented economic policies and local, community-based development methods under the auspices of international governance organizations. Smith and Font (2014) further declared that responsibility is
not used for market signaling and that communicating what is simple rather than significant is preferred. The organization's standing does not guarantee that it operates responsibly because statements about pricing and responsibility show an adverse relationship. Volunteer tourism operators inconsistently present and express responsibility, which exposes greenwashing and requests at least industry-wide norms of conduct and regulation. This study examines its methodological shortcomings as well as its practical achievements in encouraging changes within some of the organizations investigated.

Economic Growth: Responsible tourism was made available as a tool for economic growth, poverty alleviation, and heritage site protection (Koutra, 2007). By comparing innovations and new practices across Asia, Vikneswaran Nair, Badaruddin Mohamed, and Chiun LoMay (2015) focused on their research on creating more sustainable and responsible rural tourism. Corporate governance: Many developing nations attempt to balance macroeconomic, growth-oriented economic policies with local community-based development initiatives under the auspices of global governance through sustainable and responsible development.

Social Sustainability: According to Kotze (2019), there is a strong positive correlation between social and economic sustainability and residents’ perspectives on responsible tourism practices. Global Governance: Under guidance of global governance organizations, many developing nations strive to maintain a balance between macroeconomic, growth-oriented economic policies, and community-based development methods. According to the findings, power can only be genuinely transferred to community stakeholders when national and global players refocus their investments on creating a system of procedures to address local-level power and skill gaps amongst the "jointly responsible" actors. Deadlocks in local sustainable development are caused by these discrepancies (Arie, 2018).

Local Community: In Local communities are frequently recognized as drivers of sustainable development in the policies of many developing nations (Arie, 2018). Sustainable Development: Responsibilities for the positive and negative social, economic, and environmental effects of tourism are shared by enterprises, locals, visitors, and governments. By behaving and acting responsibly, tourism stakeholders assume the responsibility for sustainable development. Responsible tourism, which is considered the implementation of sustainable tourism, has already been extensively discussed in research and practice (Eichelberger et al., 2021). These findings offer valuable information for planning and implementing sustainable consumption activities to achieve the overall development of sustainable tourism for governments, the private sector, and civil society (Erawan & Krairit, 2020). Moreover, community participation in the management of tourism resources at all levels is effective (Zakaria 2021).

Responsible travelers are significantly concerned about nature, and they mostly perceive their best holidays in the natural environment. Awareness of environmentally responsible behavior has a significant impact on holiday experiences. Their experiences were classified into five levels: sensory, emotive, cognitive, behavioral, and relationship. Each of these stages of experience may be used as a guideline for encouraging and training young people to be responsible (Mathew (2022).

Stakeholder Perspective: Prior literature on responsible tourism has concentrated on establishing an association between responsible and sustainable travel and tourism, but relatively little consideration has been devoted to the many roles that tourism stakeholders play in responsible travel (Eichelberger et al., 2021). Host communities are at the heart of destination planning (Iriarte & Musikanski, 2019). Further host communities and wider stakeholders are very important and crucial to guide tourism development away from over-tourism and towards destination happiness, well-being, and sustainability.

Responsible Tourism: Over years, scholars have examined responsible tourism with an emphasis on several responsiveness pathways. Consequently, there remains a limited understanding of the antecedents and implications of this phenomenon (Mondal & Samaddar, 2022). Explain further how responsible and sustainable tourism must be both long-lasting and commercially viable, while also
being socially and ethically equitable concerning the host community. According to Mathew (2022), responsible tourism comprises four responsibility areas: economic, social, cultural, and environmental. These aspects have a major impact on the life satisfaction of the community residents.

4.4 Discussion

This study contains an organized review of the literature on responsible tourism development; however, bibliometric analysis that connects responsible tourism and analytically and objectively identified emerging works, authors, and research groups has not been done previously. The SLR, which aims to integrate research on responsible tourism practices published between 2002 and 2023, serves as the basis for this study’s design. It intends to identify current knowledge concerning the responsible development of tourism from 2002 to 2023. By leveraging the Vos Viewer software and systematic reviews and meta-analysis (PRISMA) guidelines, the researcher discovered patterns based on previous research. Over the past decade, there has been an upward trend in the research on the economic implications of sustainable tourism growth. However, despite recent achievements, the scientific literature generated thus far has not evaluated the performance of this interaction of scientific activity (Gomez-Trujillo & Gonzalez-Perez, 2021).

According to the findings of a bibliometric investigation of responsible tourism, the most influential works are concentrated among a certain number of researchers. Consequently, this study analyzes prior research agendas highly concerned with economic growth, local economic development, local governance, corporate governance, community, social sustainability, and so on, from 2015 to 2018. After identifying the development paradigm of sustainability two to three years ago, high attention was paid to sustainable tourism and responsible tourism development (Saarinen, 2021). The output of overlay visualization is clearly explained in this statement. However, the researcher discovered inadequate evidence and an absence of research in these areas. Examining deeper into market research concerns that are receiving increasing attention under the heading of sustainable consumption, there is present knowledge and cognition of the significance of tourist consumption.

These are the areas where researchers ‘provided light attention in research (green color) Using these criteria, allowing researchers to determine potential research gaps. Tourism is a business, with consequences for the environment, the economy, and society. Analyzing the research and findings of Ganglmair-Wooliscroft and Wooliscroft (2019), it is clear that while society is becoming more responsible in terms of consumption, the selection of sustainable tourist services remains relatively low. These findings also reveal a high dependence/correlation between consumers’ daily consumption habits and holiday behavior. Generally, it is reasonable to assume that society adheres to the principles of sustainable consumption in its regular activities and will adhere to the same standards during holidays. However, the adverse effects of COVID-19 extend beyond the loss of human lives; they also have short- and long-term social, economic, and political consequences. The economic importance of tourism and its expansion is an area of tremendous significance. Therefore, it is not unexpected that an extensive body of literature illustrates the various impacts of tourism. Sustainability is a vital component of tourism because it is seen as a way of satisfying the needs of stakeholders while considering the economic impact, along with existing and future social and environmental situations (Gomez-Trujillo & Gonzalez-Perez, 2021).

According to Vosviewer output, there has been a gradual increase in attention to responsible tourism and sustainability after the COVID-19 pandemic. The reason behind this was that all the people were highly concerned about their safety, and then residents and travelers were automatically adapted to the responsible consumption and production pattern. Consequently, annual scientific publications have steadily increased since 2018, demonstrating the current significance of the analysis of responsible tourism development. These findings are consistent with those of previous studies on responsible tourism development.

This study further demonstrates that a growing interest in the study of responsible and sustainable tourism development began in 2002 with the Cape Town Declaration, as suggested by previous studies.
on responsible tourism development, confirming that there is a recent and successful period of related academic literature, specifically from 2018 to date.

In addition, an investigation of this study on the geographical distribution of publications revealed that the United Kingdom has the most works, followed by the United States, China, Kenya, and India. These findings are comparable to those of publications and citations from India due to co-authored publications with countries such as the United States, UK, China, and Saudi Arabia (Raman, Achuthan, Nair, & Nedungadi, 2022). The results of this investigation revealed a wide range of approaches and disciplines used, even among the most prolific academics, demonstrating the interdisciplinary nature of research on responsible tourism development. Furthermore, it is feasible to examine relationships based on the co-authorship between published works. These findings are consistent with prior studies on economic research, demonstrating that co-authorship analysis reveals correlations among a variety of academic publications.

5. Conclusion
The systematic review and bibliometric analysis undertaken in this study focuses on the current state of Responsible Tourism Development (RTD) research. Through an examination of existing literature, this study addressed the defined objectives, revealing key trends, influential authors, and thematic clusters within the field. The synthesis of findings suggests that Responsible Tourism Development is a dynamic and evolving domain marked by a growing emphasis on community engagement, sustainable practices, and ethical considerations. The identification of authors and prominent journals provides valuable insights into the intellectual landscape of the RTD, offering a foundation for future scholarly endeavors.

Finally, the findings of this study indicate directions for future research. The researcher proposed that future study trends should focus on sustenance-based outcomes as responsible tourism development through the perceived destination sustainability dimension from the community residents’ perspective, with the aim of enhancing perceived community well-being. Further, research on responsible tourism development is increasing and maturing in countries such as the UK, the US, and China, but for other countries, there is still a significant gap. On the other hand, the number of keywords connected with responsible tourism development could be expanded to include globalization, living standards, locality, responsible consumption and production, environmental sensitivity, and an abundance of other relevant terms that could add to an in-depth investigation of the analyzed relationship.

From an empirical perspective, the findings of this study are relevant for research advocating policies that encourage responsible tourism practices. This could be a potential solution to the current economic slowdown caused by COVID-19. In this regard, there is a need for more effective statistical approaches such as effective stakeholder mapping, SWOT analysis based on responsible destination management, and value chain for responsible tourism development that allows for adequate decision-making with a high impact on the final results by respective parties. Tourists should be recognized as essential stakeholders in responsible and sustainable tourism research because their experiences and views provide valuable information for improving visitor behavior and sustainable tourism decision-making processes. Therefore, Future studies should focus on developing tourist-related indicators. Recent debates on responsible tourism have revealed a limited critical assessment of the phrase responsible for tourism. The researchers identified important limitations in the literature on responsible tourism, such as a lack of conceptualization of the term, an ambiguous conceptual differentiation between responsible and sustainable tourism, and the identification of responsible tourism as a social movement. There is a significant possibility for researchers to investigate these areas.

5.1 Limitations of Study
The systematic review and bibliometric analysis primarily relied on published literature during a specific time duration, potentially excluding valuable insights from unpublished or non-English language sources. This limitation may have affected the overall representativeness of the findings. Through a collection of previous trends in responsible tourism research, this bibliometric analysis offers in-depth insights. However, because the field of social science is dynamic, it may require more
reflection on the latest developments or the creation of new topics. Moreover, bibliometric analysis may be subject to publication bias.

References


Bertella, G., & Romanelli, C. R. (2020). Tourism initiatives developed through collaboration with foreign organizations: The emergence of responsible practices in Cuba *Tourism and Cuba* (pp. 50-66): Routledge.


Uysal, M., Sirgy, M. J., Woo, E., & Kim, H. L. (2016). Quality of life (QOL) and well-being research in tourism. *Tourism management*, 53, 244-261.


